

GENDER BIASED CONSTRUCTED BY DIGITAL MEDIA RELATED TO THE NEWS REPORT OF REGIONAL HEAD GRAFT CASE

¹Erlinda Sukmasari Wasito, ²Aida Vitayala Sjafrri Hubeis, ³Ekawati Sri Wahyuni

^{1,2,3}Department of Communications and Community Development Science,
Faculty of Human Ecology, Bogor Agricultural University, Bogor

ABSTRACT

Media is a medium of information, communication and persuasion in daily life. Every media has editorial policy on their news release. The media policy affects on how women are represented in political stages, particularly as suspects in corruption allegation. This research deals with the issues highlighted by online media concerning corruption allegations against female and male head district. This research is conducted to figure out the media framing arise from gender inequality, to analyze how female and male head district are represented by media, and to analyse the influence of the ideology embraced by media and their journalists upon the gender bias creeps in through the media report. There are two subjects of the research, Cilegon Mayor Tubagus Iman Ariyadi and Kutai Kartanegara Regent Rita Widyasari. The samples are obtained from three media: Kompas, Republika and Tirto. The research is conducted from February to June 2018. Robert Entman's framing theory is proposed to analyse the research. Result of the research suggests gender bias occurs in news report concerning corruption allegations against Head District. The research also reveals the allegations against Rita Widyasari draws more readers' attention than Tubagus Iman Ariyadi because of the stereotype of gender role. Besides, the research shows ideology embraced by the media plays bigger role than the ideology espoused by the journalists in showing gender bias related to news report on corruption allegations against female and male head district.

Keywords: corruption case, gender bias, news framing, online media

INTRODUCTION

Nowadays, media is mainly used as medium of communication. Media delivers certain messages to the readers. The messages are not always communicated as it is. The messages sometimes are intervened in strategic and systematic manners for certain purposes as communication development using media for making positive social change (McPhail 2009). The social change not always deal with economy, but also any aspects of life, including gender equality, equal

access to healthcare and education, or freedom of speech. Media becomes a medium of development when they fight for women's rights in politics. However, their support for woman are not free the media from bias.

The bias deals with the news reports about women in politics. The reports become contentious issues, mainly in favor of women's role and participation in politics as well as their femininity (Susilo 2016), for example, the report about Angelina Sondakh's graft case associated with her marital status and her personal life, particularly her relationship with high-ranking police officer and the childcare issue during her incarceration (ibid).

Discussion about female in politics are more concerned with woman's issues such as abortion, childcare, rather than men's issues such as the economy and military affairs (Jamieson, 1995; Devitt, 1999; Caroll dan Fox, 2006; Heldman, 2009 as cited in Washburn Philo and Washburn Mara, 2011). Discussions of political women tend to focus on comparatively trivial subjects such as their physical appearance, lifestyle and family (Anderson, 1995; Braden, 1996; McChesney, 1999 as cited in Washburn Philo and Washburn Mara, 2011). In another word, most discussion about female politicians are discursive, not focus on their political integrity, but her lifestyle, domestic roles and personal life.

Media helps people to describe and define something new for them, known as representation (Chao et.al 2013). Representation is necessary because the existence of something new, such minority groups, should be acknowledged. People has known about women's domestic roles, but some of them do not know about their roles in politics. Women's role in politics are represented by media. The way media represented their role relied on the ideology embraced by each media. The ideology influences the way media covers the story. The way media covers their story affect readers' thinking and response to their world (Littlejohn dan Foss 2014).

This research attempts to compare the representation between female regional head and male regional head. the representation of female regional heads in digital media is difficult to analyse because the news posted in digital media has fickle character and might change rapidly. It might come and goes very quickly (Popa dan Gavrilu 2014). The image of female regional heads is also determined by in what section the articles are featured

Women's image in lifestyle sections are clearly different from women's image in politics sections, as Yingluck's depiction, the former Thailand prime minister, in politics and in business (Sriwimorn dan Zilli 2017). Another study about female mayoral candidates showed gender bias occurred because women's participation level in politics increased around the world and the topic is relatively new. Public attentions to this topic are also considerable. Although woman participation in politics is relatively high, they are still underrepresented. The coverage about

their stories are also slightly limited. In fact, media should be the main contributor to strengthen women's position in society (Hoxha 2016).

Research on gender bias against politicians is not something new. Most of the research focused on gender bias against representative council. Prior research suggested gender bias repeatedly occur although media has supported complete equality. After taking all the above into consideration, researchers aim to examine gender bias in digital media

The research examines three national digital media, namely Kompas, Republika, and Tirto. The subjects of the research are two regional heads named as suspects in the case of alleged graft, Tubagus Iman Ariyadi and Rita Widyasari. The research attempts to figure out (1) the way media construct their report about the case in favour of gender differences (2) the way media represent the suspects related to their gender, (3) the influence of the ideology embraced by media and their journalists on gender bias occurred in their coverage.

METHODOLOGY

The research was conducted to examine news reports about graft allegations against two regional heads, mayor of Cilegon *Tubagus Imam Ariyadi and* the district head of Kutai Kartanegara *Rita Widyasari*. The data was obtained from the newspaper published from September to October 2017, coinciding with the identification of both as a suspect by the The Corruption Eradication Commission (KPK). Three media were examined during the research, Kompas, Republika, and Tirto. Those three were randomly selected, on the assumption each of them embraces different ideology. The data was analysed using Robert Entman's framing theory. There were 61 news reports examine during the research. The findings were strengthened by interview with two journalists, three editors and a political communication specialist.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Framing Theory is one of the discourse analyses. The theory is relevant to the study of media in political life (Reese, 2001). Gender theorists have also used the approach to explore the framing of women politicians and women's issues (Fontaine dan McGregor 2014).

Table 1: Media Framing of Rita Widyasari

Media Framing	Kompas	Republika	Tirto
<u>Defining Problem</u>	The district head of Kutai Kartanegara Rita Widyasari , possessing good track record, was named a suspect in a bribery and gratification cases	The district head of Kutai Kartanegara Rita Widyasari named as bribery suspect	High achiever and incorrupt bureaucrat, Rita Widyasari , named as a suspect by KPK
Diagnosing Cause	Named as a suspect in bribery and gratification cases and possessing considerable wealth	(Illicit) enrichment and named as a suspect by KPK	KPK had investigated the case for long time
Making Moral Judgment	Identified as a suspect and arrested by KPK for the sake of investigation	Entering investigation phase and KPK issued exit and entry prohibitions against the suspect	Entering investigation phase, suspended from his/her position
Suggesting Remedies	Bringing to trial	Bringing to trial	Bringing to trial

News media frames attempts to define readers understanding of any issues. There are four ways readers can easily understand the issue. *They could define problems, diagnose causes, make moral judgments, and suggest remedies (Eriyanto 2012)*. This framing theory is developed by Robert Entman. The theory involves selection and salient of certain aspect. The aspect was selected and made more salient in this research is femininity.

Table 1. showed Kompas, Republika, and Tirto looks Rita Widyasari’s case from particular point of view. Those three did not show their bias against suspects. They reported their news from KPK’s point of view and identified them as suspects and criminals. All media will always be side with KPK because they do not want to be known to promote corruption, according to Hendri Satrio, the political communication specialist from ‘Kedai Kopi’ survey institute (discussion group and public opinion study). Because of their partiality to KPK, some of their coverages were unbalanced. their stories were narrated as if the suspects had already been convicted. In fact, the suspects are not always guilty. It would be considered as character assassination when the reports corner the suspects.

Table 1 also showed how the subject is depicted. Kompas depicted Rita Widyasari as regional head, having good track record as seen from her achievement during her terms of office. The depiction draws people interest because they will ask why the regional head with such achievements should be named as a suspect by KPK.

Republika are more straightforward. Republika explicitly stated KPK identified them as suspect because of illicit enrichment. However, Tirto described Rita Widyasari as an high achiever and incorrupt bureaucrat whose participation in anticorruption campaign contrast with her crime.

Table 2: Media Framing of Tubagus Iman Ariyadi

Media Framing	Kompas	Republika	Tirto
<u>Defining Problem</u>	Cilegon Mayor Tubagus Iman Ariyadi named as a suspect by KPK	Cilegon Mayor, Tubagus Iman Ariyadi turned himself in to KPK	Cilegon Mayor Tubagus Iman Ariyadi, main suspect for <u>graft allegation</u>
Diagnosing Cause	Tubagus Iman Ariyadi, main suspect for <u>graft allegation</u> , nabbed in sting operation	caught in sting in Cilegon	Nabbed in sting operation in Cilegon
Making Moral Judgment	Identified as a suspect and arrested by KPK for the sake of investigation	Identified as a suspect and arrested by KPK for the sake of investigation	Identified as a suspect and arrested by KPK for the sake of investigation

Suggesting
Remedies

Bringing to trial

Bringing to trial

Bringing to trial

Framing of Tubagus Iman Ariyadi are not different from Rita Widyasari. All media reported the case from KPK's point of view. However, false information was conveyed by Kompas and Tirto. Both stated Ariyadi was nabbed in sting operation. In fact, he turned himself in to the KPK upon the sting operation. The sting operation nabbed suspects, other than Tubagus Iman Ariyadi.

Accuracy is the problem of digital media. Inaccuracy of online reporting stems from the importance of real-time information. The first report about Tubagus Iman Ariyadi's case might be inaccurate because KPK held the press conference a day after the sting operation. Because of unbalance coverage, media cannot preserve their neutrality. Hendri Satrio stated media cannot maintain the neutrality because they do not show their partiality to the suspect. They reported *Tubagus Iman Ariyadi* are nabbed in raid operation, not turned himself in.

Story about Woman in politics are often covered by media. However the way media covers are disadvantageous for women (Braden 1996 in Jalalzai 2006). Women in politics received less substantive coverage than men. The stories also often emphasized their traditional gender roles. At an international level, early studies on elections in the 1980s revealed (Carroll & Schreiber, 1997; Kahn, 1992, 1994; Kahn & Goldenberg, 1991), male politicians received more media coverage than their counterparts. In 1990s, the coverages were more balanced (Bystrom, 2004; Bystrom, Robertson, & Banwart, 2001; Devitt, 2002; Jalalzai, 2006; Kittilson & Fridkin, 2008; Meeks, 2012; Smith, 1997 in Areni et al 2016). No disparity between both of them in relation with media coverage (Areni et al. 2016).

The facts were not reflected in Indonesia. Kompas reported about Widyasari's case 27 times, spanning from from September to October 2017, Meanwhile Ariyadi was highlighted 11 times. Tirto reported about Widyasari's alleged graft cases 12 times. Ariyadi's case was just highlighted once. Republika reported Hariyadi's case six times and Widyasari's four times.

Researcher also interviewed journalists and editors from those media to get better knowledge about the reason behind the publish of the articles. Republika's Journalist and editor stated they actually set prior over legal matter and politics. Republika even published a lot of articles about Tubagus Iman Ariyadi's and Rita Widyasari's cases. However, search engine cannot find the articles because Republika's web search engine had not been working properly for several years.

Republika's editor said gender difference did not influence Republika's reports about Tubagus Iman Ariyadi's and Rita Widyasari's graft cases. The editor did not differentiate the case because

she is also a woman. The cases are reported in the same proportion. All news about corruption, either petty or serious, would be revealed. However, Republika's journalist had different opinion. the journalist said, editor set priority over Widyasari's case because female politicians drew more public attention than the counterparts.

Kompas' editor had different opinion. Rita Widyasari's cases drew more attention, not because of gender, but because of the news value. However, Kompas' journalist disagree with the editor.

The journalist said gender was the reason why Rita Widyasari's case drew more attention than Tubagus Iman Ariyadi's. The Journalist's opinion was agreed by Hendri Satrio. Satrio said gender of the suspect grabbed media's spotlight because the issue are more contentious and drew readers' attention. However, the spotlight does not always reflect media's supports for gender equality or women's opportunity for better public recognition. Instead of advantageous, massive media spotlight and coverage might be disadvantageous for Widyasari because of her crime.

Tirto's editor stated media spotlights to Rita Widyasari cases were given to satisfy public demand. The editor also said supply and demand affected the decision of media and editor on the news they report. The editor thought the story would be useless without readers. Tirto only focus on topics drawing people attention. Rita Widyasari's case was one of them. It topped the trending search on google. The rank was higher than Tubagus Iman Ariyadi's case. The more such cases got attention, the more they make money. Tirto focused on the story drawing people attention and make money. Tirto's decision showed that Tirto was not free from gender bias, although the editor had prohibited any use of sexist language in any report about graft case involving woman.

That is not the only reason why Tirto only covered one story about Tubagus Iman Ariyadi. Another reason is Tirto's policy on hard news. Tirto only delivers in-depth coverage. Kompas and Republika also delivers hard news. However, they rely on real-time update and concise overview.

Kompas and Tirto reported the graft case from the same point of view. Both reported that the regional heads are the children KPK's suspects for graft case. Tubagus Iman Ariyadi is a son of Cilegon former mayor. Meanwhile, Rita Widyasari is a daughter of Syaukani HR, former district head of Kutai Kertanegara. Hamad (2004) mentioned three figurative languages Kompas frequently use in their reports, namely: (1) middle ground model (*model jalan tengah*) accusing or criticizing indirectly or verbosing and roundabout (2) euphemistic and recommended model (*model angin surga*), querying rather than accusing (3) watchdog model (*model anjing penjaga*) more straightforward. Kompas use middle ground model to depict graft cases involving Tubagus Iman Aryadi.

It is not for the first time Iman deal with KPK. He had questioned as a witness in graft case related to 2012 Kubangsari Cilegon trestle pier construction. The suspect is former Cilegon mayor, Aat Syafaat, the biological father of Ariyadi

Rita Widyasari was represented in various ways. Kompas was not only focus on her track record in politics, but also her representation during her terms of office. Tubagus Iman Ariyadi was represented only from his position as a Golkar Regional Representative Council (DPD) Chairperson and his role in bribery case. Rita Widyasari's representation was elaborated further. Kompas used watchdog model to explain Rita Widyasari's relationship with her father, Syaukani Hasan Rais.

Rita Widyasari is a daughter of graft convict, (late) Syaukani HR, former district head of Kutai Kertanegara. On December 14, 2007, the Jakarta Criminal Corruption Courts convicted the non-active Kukar District Head, Syaukani on the misused of natural resources (oil and gas) stimulus fund, Kutai Airport feasibility study funds, the Kutai Airport development funds and public welfare funds.

Kompas used verbose style for giving extensive coverage of Tubagus Iman Ariyadi's father who was KPK suspect, Aat Syafaat. Meanwhile, Tirto is more straightforward. Tirto use phrase "child of the convict" to share the same thing. However, the use of the phrase is tendentious. The media attempted to shape readers' thinking about suspect's guilt. Suspect is not always guilty. Their crime should be investigated first. Their guilt should also be proven at court. Suspect should consider innocent until proven guilty. Hendri Satrio thought the phrase is unnecessary. Criminal behaviour is not inherited. Children would not always repeat their parent's mistake.

Table 2: Kompas' representation of graft suspects

Tubagus Iman Ariyadi	Rita Widyasari
1) <u>Served</u> two term as Cilegon Mayor	1) <u>Served</u> two term as the district head of Kutai Kartanegara
2) Son of KPK suspect	2) East <i>Kalimantan gubernatorial candidate</i> ,
3) DPD Golkar's <u>chairperson</u>	3) Award recipient regional head
4) Named as a suspect for graft case	4) Under KPK detention
5) <u>Under KPK</u> detention	5) First <u>detainee</u> of KPK detention centre
6) <u>Venal</u>	6) <u>Venal</u>
7) <u>Mastermind behind bribery scandal</u>	7) DPD Golkar's chairperson
	8) Regional Head who active in

- anticorruption campaign
- 9) Daughter of KPK graft convict
- 10) Speaker of the Regional House of Representatives of Kukar
- 11) Having enormous wealth
- 12) Showing good manner in public
- 13) Giving good performance during her term of office

Rita, East Kalimantan DPD Golkar’s chairperson, was the daughter of graft convict, (late) Syaukani Hasan Rais. On December 11 years ago, the KPK named Syaukani as a suspect in graft case case of the Loa Kulu Airport land acquisition. The graft cost Indonesia more than Rp. 15.3 billion.

Just a few days ago, Cilegon Mayor, Tubagus Iman Ariyadi followed the bad example of his father, (late) Aat Syafaat to become KPK detainee.

Table 3: Tirto representation of graft suspects

Tubagus Iman Ariyadi	Rita Widayari
1) Cilegon Mayor	1) <u>Served</u> two term as the district head of Kutai Kartanegara
2) Graft Suspect	2) DPD Golkar’s chairperson
3) caught <i>red-handed</i>	3) Graft Suspects
4) The son graft convict	4) Questioned as a suspect
	5) The daughter of graft convict
	6) Achieve excellence district head

The main reasons why Kompas and Tirto reported about the case involving the suspects ‘parents are to reveal political dynasty. Both regional heads served as regional heads right after their fathers’ term of office ended. They seem not only succeed their father as regional heads but also follow their corrupt regime. Tirto saw clear connection between graft case and political dynasty. The suspects of the graft case are the children of former regional heads who are convicted for graft case. These media coverages are expected to be a lesson for the readers. The readers are expected to be aware about the danger of political dynasty.

Tabel 4: Republika’s Tirto representation of graft suspects

Tubagus Iman Ariyadi	Rita Widyasari
1) Cilegon Mayor	1) the district head of Kutai
2) Graft Suspect	Kartanegara
3) <u>Venal</u>	2) Golkar politicians
4) Asking for a bribe	3) Graft suspects
	4) Questioned as a suspect
	5) Venal

Republika’s suggested that they were no longer report about political dynasties because they did not have any reliable data about the political dynasty built by those suspects. The editor stated requirements should be fulfilled, for news, in order to be called as political dynasty. The requirement deals with position offered by the government officials to their family members. The same opinion about political dynasty is shared by Hendri Satrio.

Concise definition is offered Qurebin (2010) as cited by Sutisna (2017). Qurebin stated that political dynasties are a small number of families dominating the distribution of power in certain geographical areas. Another definition is proposed by Asako et al (2012) as cited by Sutisna (2017), referring to family members that also serve for the same position in the past. Both researches did not indicate any requirement specified in the penultimate paragraph. Insofar the officials are kinship, they are building political dynasty and wielding an enormous power.

Journalists had freedom in carrying and covering any news. They could write and cover any news that should people know. Republika’s journalist said he did not favour a case over another. Either petty or enormous, all of them should be reported. However, decision is in editor hand. Editors were entitled to decide about the article should be published or prioritized. Editors did not give journalists’ direction related to the story should write or not. They just tell about the article should be highlighted. This direction deals with the ideology embraced by the media. The ideology will filter through the story should be published or not. Editors just published the article in line with the media ideology. Kompas had been preserved catholic identity. Nowadays, the identity little bit changed and Kompas already adopted capitalist ideology as well as Tirto. Both just published the story that draw viewers interests. The more story got attention and traffic, the more the story make money. Hendri Satrio said digital media try to capture readers’ attention through the sensational headline.

Unlike Kompas and Tirto, Republika adopted sectarian ideology. Republika has promoted Islamic ideology since the beginning. Republika always conveyed positive impression about Islamic parties and other parties with a lot of Muslims figure (Hamad 2004). Media ideology did not have much influence in the way media report about the graft case because media sided with the KPK's policy.

CONCLUSION

- 1) The research on news framing of Tubagus Iman Ariyadi and Rita Widyasari suggest three media does not demonstrate bias against both of them. Their reports reveal that they collide with the suspects over the crime they commit. The media shows their partiality toward KPK's policy. This is reasonable because media because they do not want to be known to favour over corruption. Due to their partiality to KPK, some of their coverages were unbalanced. their stories were narrated as if the suspects has proven guilty. Report about Rita Widyasari's case tends to be deeper than the Tubagus Iman Hariyadi's. Not only her cases, her track record are also elaborated.
- 2) Researchers found Kompas and Tirto represented Rita Widyasari in many ways. The number of Rita Widyasari's representations are similar to Tubagus Iman Ariyadi's. All of them related to graft case. Kompas reported about Widyasari, serving as Regional Heads in two terms, having good performance, recognizing high achievement, and supporting KPK's anti-corruption campaign. Her images are inversely proportional to the fact Rita Widyasari is a KPK's detainee and suspect. Broader representations are not always bad unless generated to public figure like Rita Widrasari.
- 3) The result of interviews shows that the way media contract their reports are influenced by their ideology. Kompas and Tirto focused on Rita Widyasari's graft case because the case sparks more people's curiosity than to Tubagus Iman Ariyadi's. Kompas and Republika adopt sectarian ideology. However, the ideology does not influence in the way the cases are constructed. Kompas and Republika Editors from those media denies their bias against the suspects, but the journalists admit.

REFERENCES

- 1) Areni A, Dal Secco A, Sensales G. 2016. Italian Political Communication and Gender Bias: Press Representations of Men/Women Presidents of The House of Parlianment. *IJSL*, 4(2): 22-38.
- 2) Chao ML, Gutierrez F, Chao CC. 2013. Racism, Sexism, and the Media: Multicultural Issue Into the New Communication Age Fourth Edition. USA: Sage Publications, Inc.

- 3) Dewi KH, Kusumaningtyas AN, Izzati FF, Ekawati E. 2017. Perempuan Kepala Daerah dalam Jejaring Oligarki Lokal. Jakarta: Lipi Press.
- 4) Eriyanto. 2012. Analisis Framing: Konstruksi, Ideologi, dan Politik Media. Yogyakarta: LKiS.
- 5) Hamad I. 2004. Konstruksi Realitas Politik dalam Media Massa: Sebuah Studi Critical Discourse Analysis terhadap Berita-berita Politik. Jakarta: Granit.
- 6) Hoxha I. 2016. The Representation of The Women in Media Discourse in Albania. *Social and Natural Science Journal*, 10(1): 11-16.
- 7) Jalalzai F. 2006. Women Candidates and The Media. *Politics and Policy*, 34(3): 606-633.
- 8) Littlejohn SW, Foss KA. 2014. Teori Komunikasi. Jakarta: Penerbit Salemba Humanika.
- 9) McPhail TL. 2009. Development Communication: Reframming The Role of The Media. UK: Willey-Blackwell.
- 10) Parera FM, Sularto S, Sutamat M, Pour J, Nainggolan JB, Subagyo H, Hartiningsih M, Pambudy NM, Mulyadi E, Adiprasetyo A *et al.* 2007. Kompas, Menulis dari Dalam. Jakarta: PT Buku Kompas.
- 11) Popa D, Gavriiliu D. 2014. Gender Representations and Digital Media. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Science*, 180 (2015): 1199-1206.
- 12) Sriwimon L, Zili PJ. 2017. Applying Critical Discourse Analysis as a Conceptual Framework for Investigating Gender Stereotypes in Political Media Discourse. *Kasersart Journal of Social Science*, 38: 136-142.
- 13) Susilo D. 2016. Perempuan dan Korupsi Wacana Media dalam Berita Tindak Pidana Korupsi Perempuan. *Jurnal Perempuan*, 2016: 1416-1441.
- 14) Sutisna A. 2017. Gejala Proliferasi Dinasti Politik di Banten Era Kepemimpinan Gubernur Ratu Atut Chosiyah. *Indonesian Political Science Review*, 2017 (2): 100-120.
- 15) Washburn, PC. Washburn, MH. 2011. Media Coverage of Women in Politics: The Curious Case of Sarah Palin. *Media and Culture Society*, 33(7): 1027-1041.